

EXHIBIT “D”

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

- - - - - x

SUNIL KUMAR, Ph.D, PRAVEEN SINHA, Ph.D.,
Plaintiff,

Case No.

2:22-CV-07550-RGK-MAA

-against-

DR. JOLENE KOESTER, in her official capacity
as Chancellor of California State University,

Defendant.

- - - - - x

VIRTUAL CONFERENCE

September 25th, 2023

11:03 a.m.

EXAMINATION BEFORE TRIAL of PROFESSOR
AJANTHA SUBRAMANIAN, the Defendant herein,
taken by MR. SHAEFFER, in the above-entitled
action, held at the above time and place,
pursuant to Subpoena, taken before ALEXIS
TORRES, a Shorthand Reporter and Notary Public
within and for the State of New York.

Magna Legal Services

(866) 624-6221

www.MagnaLS.com

1

2

A. SUBRAMANIAN

3

one definition that explicitly

4

references the South Asian caste

5

system, and then there will be a second

6

definition, which sort of generalizes

7

it to a kind of global phenomenon,

8

right?

9

So there, you see that caste has

10

become a kind of umbrella category to

11

talk about different descent based

12

systems. Why that's happened? I mean,

13

that's a historical question, right?

14

Why does one term become a kind of

15

umbrella term to encompass, you know,

16

different iterations, right, of a

17

social system? That's a historical

18

question that I don't have enough

19

expertise to answer.

20

Q. Are you offering any opinions on

21

how an ordinary American would

22

understand the term caste?

23

MR. MICHALOWSKI: Vague and

24

ambiguous. You can answer.

25

A. I don't know how -- you know,

1

2

A. SUBRAMANIAN

3

what different Americans come to the term with. I mean, it probably varies widely depending on who the person is.

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

Q. You mentioned a moment ago that it's becoming an umbrella term. I'm just wondering where it's becoming an umbrella term. Is it becoming an umbrella term in academia, or is it becoming an umbrella term in your area of specialty of anthropology, or are you offering any opinion as to it becoming an umbrella term in just common parlance?

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

A. I think, again, like, it's a very contextually specific. So the -- Professor Ravich's report suggest that it's been an umbrella term in U.S. law for quite a while, right? In terms of the American public, I think the publication of Isabel Wilkerson's book, Caste, which, you know, shot up to the bestseller list, I think that has been really influential in sort of educating

1

2

A. SUBRAMANIAN

3

within governing structures. They

4

likened those groups to "Castas,"

5

right? Which were similar, sort of,

6

ranked, social groups in the Iberian

7

Empires, right? So there was a sort of

8

analogy that they drew between

9

descent-based forms of social

10

stratification, the Iberian Empires,

11

and the descent-based forms of social

12

stratification in South Asia, which

13

went by the term Jati.

14

So that sort of correlation was

15

drawn, and -- and you know, as with any

16

correlation, they were both -- there

17

were accuracy and inaccuracy, I

18

suppose. But since the 16th century,

19

caste has become indigenized in the way

20

that, you know, if you look

21

historically, there's lot of what are

22

called "loan words" that come into a

23

social space and then become sort of

24

indigenized within that social space.

25

So that's what has happened with caste.

1

2

A. SUBRAMANIAN

3

caste as a protected category, and

4

yeah, there seems to be a pretty common

5

sense understanding of what it is.

6

That it is -- that it's a hereditary

7

and hierarchical form of social

8

difference. I mean, that seems to be

9

what is a kind of common sense

10

understanding of it.

11

(Whereupon, an essay was

12

marked as Plaintiff's Exhibit 3

13

for Identification.)

14

Q. Let me show you an article that

15

you wrote a couple years ago for the

16

New York Times, if you still stand by

17

what you said. An essay titled, "Why

18

Is Caste Inequality Still Legal in the

19

United States."

20

A. Mm-hmm.

21

Q. Is that an essay you co-authored

22

on around May 25th, 2021?

23

A. Mm-hmm.

24

Q. Is that a "Yes?"

25

A. Yes.

1

2

A. SUBRAMANIAN

3

4

Q. Sorry, one of the other rules that I forgot to tell you is, "Mm-hmm" and "Uh-huh" cannot be transcribed.

5

6

A. Yes, okay.

7

8

Q. And nods of the head also. So occasionally I will remind you.

9

10

11

12

13

14

MR. MICHALOWSKI: I am quite impressed that we've made it 80 minutes into the deposition and we've just heard our first "Mm-hmm." So nicely done, Professor.

15

16

17

18

19

20

By the way, Professor, we've been going about 80 minutes. If, at any point, you need a break, maybe after this line of questioning would be a good time to take a break.

21

22

23

24

25

MR. SHAEFFER: Sure. Let's take a break after this question.

Q. You wrote this article?

A. Yes.

Q. And the very first sentence

1

2

A. SUBRAMANIAN

3

says, "Caste is not well understood in

4

the United States?"

5

A. Mm-hmm.

6

Q. There you go again.

7

A. Yes.

8

Q. And you still stand by that

9

statement?

10

A. So what I would say is that I

11

don't think that caste -- the nuances

12

of how caste functions among -- which

13

is what I said -- among people of South

14

Asian descent, I don't think those

15

nuances are well understood. Does that

16

mean that caste, more generally, as a

17

kind of hierarchical and hereditary

18

system is not understood? No.

19

I think that most people

20

understand caste as -- like, the

21

foundational principles of caste, which

22

is heredity and hierarchy, I think

23

those are understood, but the nuances

24

of what caste references, the forms of

25

social distinction, I mean -- I don't

1

2

A. SUBRAMANIAN

3

4

5

Q. There's more than one billion Indians across the world, aren't there, of people of Indian descent?

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

A. Sure, but it doesn't say that that one billion people are all South Asians. It says, "Caste is a structure of oppression that affects one billion people across the world based in birth that determines social status and assigning spiritual purity." And then they go on to further -- one can think of the second as an instance of the first or one can think of the second as equal to the first. And I think it's kind of ambiguous whether it's one instance of a larger structure of oppression or whether this is the only reference for that structure of oppression.

22

23

24

25

Q. It says there are four main caste groups, and it identifies the four from the Varna and then as the Dalits, correct?

1

2

A. SUBRAMANIAN

3

A. Yes.

4

5

Q. And if I'm in China, those caste groups don't exist in china outside the India diaspora, do they?

6

7

A. No, they don't.

8

9

10

11

Q. And they don't exist really anywhere in the world outside South Asia, correct, except with the diaspora of South Asians?

12

A. Right.

13

14

15

(Whereupon, CSSA resolution was marked as Plaintiff's Exhibit 5 for Identification.)

16

17

18

19

20

Q. Let me mark the students. This is Exhibit 5. This is the Cal State Student Association's resolution, and it's virtually identical or very, very similar to the faculty one, correct?

21

A. Yes.

22

23

24

Q. It identifies the four caste groups that are identified by the Varna, right?

25

A. Mm-hmm.

1

2

A. SUBRAMANIAN

3

action categories of the Indian state.

4

Like, all of these are ways of thinking

5

about caste difference. And one or

6

more of them can be in place at any

7

given moment, so it really depends.

8

Q. Is there a consensus?

9

A. On what?

10

Q. Would you agree, is there a

11

consensus in the academic community? I

12

know there is an outliner for

13

everything. Is there an consensus in

14

the academic community that Jati and

15

caste are used interchangeable?

16

A. I would say that caste is the

17

most common translation of the word

18

Jati in -- you know, in anglophone

19

scholarship.

20

Q. And then, Varna is just

21

something completely different, Varna a

22

textual hypothetical social

23

organization?

24

A. Yeah. You know, I think -- I

25

tend to think about Varna, again, as a

1

2

A. SUBRAMANIAN

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

A. No, but this is why caste is a useful umbrella term because it's a kind of -- what's that word in linguistic anthropology? It's a kind of mediating term, right, that allows you to draw comparisons between similar social institutions in other places.

Yeah.

Q. We were talking a moment ago, before I got sidetracked again, about your opinion that caste is not -- let me step back a bit. Is it your opinion that caste is not derived from Hinduism, or is it your opinion that caste is not associated by people rightly or wrongly with Hinduism?

A. The first.

Q. And are you offering?

A. The first. It's not derived from Hinduism, but yes, it is often associated with Hinduism.

Q. Looking at pages 7 and 8 of your report --

1

2

A. SUBRAMANIAN

3

what I've heard, which is it's

4

socioeconomic discrimination?

5

A. He uses a --

6

7

MR. MICHALOWSKI: I'm sorry,

8

Professor, to interrupt you. I

9

need to make my objection, which

10

is the question is compound, the

11

question poses an incomplete

12

hypothetical. You can answer.

13

A. He uses himself as an example.

14

He's a dark skinned Harvard professor,

15

and he describes forms of colorism that

16

he was subjected to.

17

Q. Okay. Wrapping up a few more

18

questions. Can someone in the United

19

States, who's not of South Asian

20

descent, be a victim of caste

21

discrimination that's distinct from

22

racial ethnic discrimination?

23

A. If they've been discriminated

24

against on the basis of descent, yes.

25

Q. So why not use the word descent?

1

2

A. SUBRAMANIAN

3

MR. MICHALOWSKI:

4

Foundation.

5

A. Why not use the term caste?

6

Q. Isn't descent a much more

7

inclusive and understandable term

8

amongst the general population of the

9

United States?

10

MR. MICHALOWSKI: Objection.

11

This specific question has been

12

asked and answered, and Professor

13

Subramanian is not a linguist.

14

She's been designated to testify

15

based on her anthropological

16

background, so this question is

17

beyond the scope and lacks

18

foundation.

19

Q. Answer.

20

A. I don't have an answer.

21

Q. In terms of the South Asian

22

diaspora, can someone's caste commonly

23

be determined by their name; is their

24

name an indication of caste?

25

A. It can be.